# Visual Explainability in Machine Learning Lecture 3: Visual Explanations I





Ghassan AlRegib, PhD Professor Mohit Prabhushankar, PhD Postdoctoral Fellow

Omni Lab for Intelligent Visual Engineering and Science (OLIVES) School of Electrical and Computer Engineering Georgia Institute of Technology {alregib, mohit.p}@gatech.edu Dec 5, 2023







## **Short Course Materials**

Accessible Online



https://alregib.ece.gatech.edu/spseducation-short-course/ {alregib, mohit.p}@gatech.edu



# Title: Visual Explainability in Machine Learning

Presented by: Ghassan AlRegib, and Mohit Prabhushankar

Omni Lab for Intelligent Visual Engineering and Science (OLIVES)

School of Electrical and Computer Engineering

Georgia Institute of Technology, Atlanta, USA

https://alregib.ece.gatech.edu/



2 of 45

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]





## **Short Course**

**Course Outline** 

#### Day 1: Define and Detail; Day 2: Evaluate; Day 3: Reassess







## Outline

### Lecture 3: Visual Explanations I

- Human-centric Explanations
- Indirect Explanations
  - Visualizing filters
  - Visualizing activations
  - Visualizing Last layer Embedding
- Direct Explanations
  - Intervention-based visualizations
    - Saliency Maps
  - Gradient-based visualizations
    - Vanilla Backpropagation
    - Deconvolution Backpropagation
    - Guided Backpropagation
- Takeaways





## Outline

#### Lecture 3: Visual Explanations I

- Human-centric Explanations
- Indirect Explanations
  - Visualizing filters
  - Visualizing activations
  - Visualizing Last layer Embedding
- Direct Explanations
  - Intervention-based visualizations
    - Saliency Maps
  - Gradient-based visualizations
    - Vanilla Backpropagation
    - Deconvolution Backpropagation
    - Guided Backpropagation
- Takeaways





## **Explanations** Human-centric Explanations

Explanations can be characterized based on the knowledge of the audience they cater to

#### Lecture 3: Indirect and Direct Explanations



#### Lecture 4: Targeted Explanations



6 of 45



CELEBRATING 75 YEARS

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]

AlRegib, Ghassan, and Mohit Prabhushankar. "Explanatory paradigms in neural networks: Towards relevant and contextual explanations." *IEEE Signal Processing Magazine* 39.4 (2022): 59-72.



## **Explanations** Indirect Explanations

Indirect explanations visually analyze network parameters and features and indirectly explain the output

- Required knowledge to understand explanations:
   Models, model parameters, and training data
- Required Knowledge to obtain explanations: Models, model parameters, and training data
- Explanations audience: Researchers and Engineers building the models
- Explanatory chronology: Initially, all Explainability techniques were indirect

Methods	Indirect	Direct	Targeted
Deconvolution [21]	$\checkmark$	_	_
Inverted Representations [22]	$\checkmark$	_	_
Guided-Backpropagation [18]	_	$\checkmark$	_
SmoothGrad [17]	_	$\checkmark$	_
LIME [39]	_	$\checkmark$	_
CAM [24]	—	$\checkmark$	-
Graph-CNN [23]	$\checkmark$	_	_
GradCAM [12]	_	_	$\checkmark$
TCAV [40]	_	$\checkmark$	_
GradCAM++ [16]	_	_	$\checkmark$
RISE [35]	_	$\checkmark$	_
Causal-CAM [15]	_	—	$\checkmark$
Counterfactual-CAM [12]	_	_	$\checkmark$
Goyal et al. [26]	_	_	$\checkmark$
CEM [29]	_	_	$\checkmark$
Contrast-CAM [13]	_	_	$\checkmark$
Contrastive reasoning [14]	_	_	$\checkmark$



7 of 45

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]

AlRegib, Ghassan, and Mohit Prabhushankar. "Explanatory paradigms in neural networks: Towards relevant and contextual explanations." *IEEE Signal Processing Magazine* 39.4 (2022): 59-72.





#### Definition

## Outline

## Lecture 3: Visual Explanations I

- Human-centric Explanations
- Indirect Explanations

#### • Visualizing filters

- Visualizing activations
- Visualizing Last layer Embedding
- Direct Explanations
  - Intervention-based visualizations
    - Saliency Maps
  - Gradient-based visualizations
    - Vanilla Backpropagation
    - Deconvolution Backpropagation
    - Guided Backpropagation





Visualizing Filters in the First Layer

#### Filters are looking for *low-level* oriented edges, color blobs, textures, background etc.



- 64 filters in the first convolutional layer
- Filter size: 11 x 11 x 3 (visualized as RGB images)



9 of 45

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]

Krizhevsky et al. "Imagenet classification with deep convolutional neural networks." Advances in neural information processing systems 25 (2012)



Visualizing Filters in the First Layer

#### Filters in the first convolutional layers across different architectures learn similar patterns





AlexNet: 64 x 3 x 11 x 11



10 of 45

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]

Krizhevsky et al. "Imagenet classification with deep convolutional neural networks." Advances in neural information processing systems 25 (2012)





Visualizing Filters in the Intermediate Layers

#### Filters in higher convolutional layers are not as interpretable as filters in the first layer

Visualizing the filters (raw weights)

Conv layer 2 weights 20 x 16 x 7 x 7 (visualize as 16 grayscale images)

Conv layer 3 weights 20 x 20 x 7 x 7 (visualize as 20 grayscale images)



[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]

Krizhevsky et al. "Imagenet classification with deep convolutional neural networks." Advances in neural information processing systems 25 (2012)





## Outline

## Lecture 3: Visual Explanations I

- Human-centric Explanations
- Indirect Explanations
  - Visualizing filters
  - Visualizing activations
  - Visualizing Last layer Embedding
- Direct Explanations
  - Intervention-based visualizations
    - Saliency Maps
  - Gradient-based visualizations
    - Vanilla Backpropagation
    - Deconvolution Backpropagation
    - Guided Backpropagation
- Takeaways





Visualizing Activations in the Intermediate Layers I

#### Higher layers are activated by semantic concepts rather than features

Intermediate layers:

- Weights: not very interpretable
- Activations: interpretable

# The filter in green box is activated when it sees a wheel

However, it is irrational to explain billions of parameters by individual activation inspection



Conv 5 layer of AlexNet



13 of 45

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]





Yosinski et al, "Understanding Neural Networks Through Deep Visualization", ICML DL Workshop 2014.

Visualizing Activations in the Intermediate Layers II: Maximally Activating Patches

Visualize patterns in images that cause the maximum activations of certain neurons

- Maximally Activating Patches:
  - Image patches in the input that cause the maximum activations of certain filters
- Obtaining Maximally Activating Patches:
  - Pick activations in a layer
  - Feed forward images through the network, record values of the chosen channel
  - Visualize image patches that correspond to maximal activation











#### Each row corresponds to a particular neuron in conv5



14 of 45

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]



Gr Georgia Tech

Springenberg et al, "Striving for Simplicity: The All Convolutional Net", ICLR Workshop 2015

#### Visualizing Activations in the Intermediate Layers III: DeconvNet

#### Train a decoder network using activations from a given intermediate layer



Left: Deconvolution network, Right: Convolutional encoder

- **DeconvNet:** An additional deconvolution network is added to map features back into input space
- Instead of directly visualizing patches from the input images, reconstruct maximally activating patches

15 of 45



[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]

Matthew D Zeiler and Rob Fergus, "Visualizing and understanding convolutional networks," in European conference on computer vision. Springer, 2014, pp. 818–833





## Outline

## Lecture 3: Visual Explanations I

- Human-centric Explanations
- Indirect Explanations
  - Visualizing filters
  - Visualizing activations
  - Visualizing Last layer Embedding
- Direct Explanations
  - Intervention-based visualizations
    - Saliency Maps
  - Gradient-based visualizations
    - Vanilla Backpropagation
    - Deconvolution Backpropagation
    - Guided Backpropagation
- Takeaways





Visualizing Last Layer Activations

#### Last layer activations consist of class-specific information

- We can group the images that have similar classspecific information by exploring last layer activations
- Last layer activations (embedding):
  - 4096-dimensional feature vector for an image (layer immediately before the classifier)
  - Representations of entire input images instead of specific patches
  - Similar embeddings correspond to same classes of input images







Visualizing Last Layer Activations

#### Last layer activations consist of class-specific information

- Last layer activations (embedding):
  - 4096-dimensional feature vector for an image (layer immediately before the classifier)
  - Representations of *entire input images* instead of specific patches
  - Similar embeddings correspond to same classes of input images
- Feed forward images through the network, collect the final layer feature vectors
- Visualize input images that have similar last layer embeddings







Visualizing Last Layer Activations I: Nearest Neighbor Samples

### Explanations refer to retrieving the nearest neighbors (from train set) of given test image



L2 Nearest neighbors in

#### Test image L2 Nearest neighbors in **feature** space



The **features** of the two dogs **share L2 similarity** in feature space

•

 In image space, they are not L2-similar due to horizontally flipped poses







Visualizing Last Layer Activations II: Dimensionality Reduction

### Explanations refer to retrieving the nearest neighbors (from train set) of given test image

- Last layer embedding:
  - 4096-dimensional feature vector for an image
- Visualize the "feature space" by reducing dimensionality of feature vectors from 4096 to 2 dimensions
  - Each 2-dim feature correspond to an input image



fully-connected 7



20 of 45



Van der Maaten and Hinton, "Visualizing Data using t-SNE", JMLR 2008

Visualizing Last Layer Activations II: Dimensionality Reduction

### Explanations refer to retrieving the nearest neighbors (from train set) of given test image

- Last layer embedding:
  - 4096-dimensional feature vector for an image
- Dimensionality reduction using t-SNE (t-distributed stochastic neighbor embedding)
- Embed *high-dimensional data* points so that **locally, pairwise distances are conserved** i.e., similar classes end up in clusters, while dissimilar classes are separated





21 of 45





Van der Maaten and Hinton, "Visualizing Data using t-SNE", JMLR 2008

Summary

# Indirect explanations require network knowledge from the humans interpreting the explanations

Indirect Explanations:

- Visualize weights (filters) in conv layers
- Retrieve maximally activating patches
- Reconstruct input images
- Retrieve nearest neighbor images in features space
- Compute last layer embeddings

Visualize, retrieve, reconstruct, and compute require the "technical know how"





Maximally activating patches



Nearest neighbor images



Last layer embeddings



22 of 45

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]





## Outline

## Lecture 3: Visual Explanations I

- Human-centric Explanations
- Indirect Explanations
  - Visualizing filters
  - Visualizing activations
  - Visualizing Last layer Embedding
- Direct Explanations
  - Intervention-based visualizations
    - Saliency Maps
  - Gradient-based visualizations
    - Vanilla Backpropagation
    - Deconvolution Backpropagation
    - Guided Backpropagation
- Takeaways





## **Explanations** Direct Explanations

# Direct explanations highlight all regions in an image that lead to a decision

- Required knowledge to understand explanations: None
- Required knowledge to obtain explanations: Models, model parameters, and training data
- Explanations audience: Researchers and Engineers building the models
- Explanatory chronology: Most (existing) explanatory techniques are direct

#### Methods Indirect Direct Targeted Deconvolution [21] Inverted Representations [22] Guided-Backpropagation [18] SmoothGrad [17] LIME [39] CAM [24] Graph-CNN [23] GradCAM [12] TCAV [40] GradCAM++ [16] RISE [35] Causal-CAM [15] Counterfactual-CAM [12] $\checkmark$ Goyal et al. [26] CEM [29] Contrast-CAM [13] Contrastive reasoning [14]



ELEBRATINC 75 VEAL

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]

AlRegib, Ghassan, and Mohit Prabhushankar. "Explanatory paradigms in neural networks: Towards relevant and contextual society explanations." IEEE Signal Processing Magazine 39.4 (2022): 59-72.





#### Definition

Saliency via Occlusion

#### Mask part of the image and check the change in predicted probabilities



A gray patch or patch of average pixel value of the dataset

**Note:** <u>Not</u> a black patch because the input images are centered to zero in the preprocessing (More in lecture 5)



25 of 45

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023] Zeiler and Fergus, "Visualizing and Understanding Convolutional Networks", ECCV 2014



Saliency via Occlusion

#### Mask part of the image and check the change in predicted probabilities





[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023] Zeiler and Fergus, "Visualizing and Understanding Convolutional Networks", ECCV 2014





Saliency via Occlusion

#### Visualize the heatmap of pixels that cause decrease in probabilities when masked









African elephant, Loxodonta africana



go-kart







[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023] Zeiler and Fergus, "Visualizing and Understanding Convolutional Networks", ECCV 2014





-08

- 0.7

0.6

## **Direct Explanations** Saliency via Occlusion

#### Visualize the heatmap of pixels that cause decrease in probabilities when masked





African elephant, Loxodonta africana

# Necessity property from Lecture 2: Features are said to be necessary if their deletion causes a misclassification

- Saliency via Occlusion is an approximation of necessity property and can objectively be evaluated as "good"
- However, the method is **computationally expensive**



28 of 45

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023] Zeiler and Fergus, "Visualizing and Understanding Convolutional Networks", ECCV 2014



## Outline

## Lecture 3: Visual Explanations I

- Human-centric Explanations
- Indirect Explanations
  - Visualizing filters
  - Visualizing activations
  - Visualizing Last layer Embedding
- Direct Explanations
  - Intervention-based visualizations
    - Saliency Maps
  - Gradient-based visualizations
    - Vanilla Backpropagation
    - Deconvolution Backpropagation
    - Guided Backpropagation
- Takeaways





### Saliency via Feature Importance

#### Finding alternatives to necessity property: Feature Importance







#### We define a new property called feature importance. A toy example:

In logistic regression, for each feature  $x_i$ , a weight  $w_i$  represents its importance 

> $P(y = 1 | \mathbf{x}) = \sigma(\mathbf{w}^T \mathbf{x} + b)$  $P(y = 0 | \mathbf{x}) = 1 - \sigma(\mathbf{w}^T \mathbf{x} + b)$

We want to generate pixel saliency maps by deep models as feature importance maps 







#### Saliency via Feature Importance

#### Saliency, approximated by gradients w.r.t. input, can be obtained via backpropagation

- Highly non-linear mapping function  $f_{\theta}: \mathcal{X} \to \mathcal{Y}:$  $\widehat{Y} = \varphi \left( \varphi \left( \varphi \left( X \left( W^{(1)} \right)^T + o(b^{(1)})^T \right) \left( W^{(2)} \right)^T + o(b^{(2)})^T \right) \left( W^{(3)} \right)^T + o(b^{(3)})^T \right)$
- Assume that we can 'linearize' the model using Taylor series

$$\widehat{Y} \approx X(W)^T + o(b)^T$$

$$W \approx \frac{\partial \widehat{Y}}{\partial X}$$



$$f(a)+rac{f'(a)}{1!}(x-a)+rac{f''(a)}{2!}(x-a)^2+rac{f'''(a)}{3!}(x-a)^3+\cdots,$$





Gradient-based Saliency via Backpropagation

Saliency, approximated by gradients w.r.t. input, can be obtained via backpropagation

Forward pass: Compute probabilities





#### Saliency map

Backward pass: Compute gradients Compute gradient of (unnormalized) class score with respect to image pixels

Then visualize the max of absolute value over RGB channels



[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]

Simonyan, Vedaldi, and Zisserman, "Deep Inside Convolutional Networks: Visualising Image Classification Models and Saliency Maps", ICLR Workshop 2014.





32 of 45

 $\frac{\partial \hat{y}_c}{\partial X}$ 

Gradient-based Saliency via Backpropagation

#### Saliency, approximated by gradients w.r.t. input, can be obtained via backpropagation



33 of 45







[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]

Simonyan, Vedaldi, and Zisserman, "Deep Inside Convolutional Networks: Visualising Image Classification Models and Saliency Maps", ICLR Workshop 2014.





Gradient-based Saliency via Backpropagation

Saliency maps can be used to help unsupervised semantic segmentation



Note: The network is trained only for classification. But it is **sensitive** to the all class-related visual **regions/features** in images



34 of 45

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]

Simonyan, Vedaldi, and Zisserman, "Deep Inside Convolutional Networks: Visualising Image Classification Models and Saliency Maps", ICLR Workshop 2014.





Gradient-based Saliency via Backpropagation

### Saliency Maps can find biases

When all training wolf images have snow, network may use these snow pixels as salient regions for prediction

Wolf vs. dog classifier is actually a snow vs. nosnow classifier



(a) Husky classified as wolf



(b) Explanation snow pixels as salient regions



35 of 45

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023] Ribeiro et al, ""Why Should I Trust You?" Explaining the Predictions of Any Classifier", ACM KDD 2016





Vanilla Backpropagation

**Method**: Backpropagate by performing all the operations of the network (Unpooling, Filtering...). For ReLU non-linearities, **only pass gradients to regions of positive activations** 

Saliency map by vanilla backprop



$$\label{eq:forward} \begin{split} \mathbf{Forwa} \\ h^{l+1} = \max\{0, h^l\} \end{split}$$

ward pass 
$$h^l$$

2

-3

 $\frac{\partial L}{\partial h^l} = [\![h^l > 0]\!] \frac{\partial L}{\partial h^{l+1}} \quad \mbox{Backward pass:} \label{eq:backgroup}$ 



Gradients from the later layer

#### positive activations in the previous layer



36 of 45

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]

Springenberg, Dosovitskiy, et al., Striving for Simplicity: The all convolutional net, 2015





**Deconvnet Backpropagation** 

The way DeconvNet Backpropagation handles the ReLU non-linearities is different as they propose to **only propagate positive gradient** 

*Rectifying the backpropagation* empirically produce better saliency visualizations

# Saliency map by deconv backprop



Cleaner saliency map

We can think of **Deconvnet** as **rectified gradients propagation** 

$$\frac{\partial L}{\partial h^l} = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{\partial L}{\partial h^{l+1}} > 0 \end{bmatrix} \frac{\partial L}{\partial h^{l+1}} \quad \text{Backward pass}$$

 
 -2
 3
 -1

 6
 -3
 1
 ∂L ∂h<sup>l+1</sup>

 2
 -1
 3

Gradients from the later layer

#### positive gradient in the later layer



37 of 45

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]

Springenberg, Dosovitskiy, et al., Striving for Simplicity: The all convolutional net, 2015





**Guided Backpropagation** 

Guided backpropagation propose to **propagate positive gradient and rectified by positive activations** 

**Non-intuitive** approach but **empirically** produce better saliency visualizations

 $h^{l+1} = \max\{0, h^l\}$ 

Forward pass 
$$h^l$$

 $\frac{\partial L}{\partial h^{l}} = \llbracket h^{l} > 0 \rrbracket \llbracket \frac{\partial L}{\partial h^{l+1}} > 0 \rrbracket \frac{\partial L}{\partial h^{l+1}}$ Backward pass: guided backpropagation

positive gradient in

the later layer

**positive activations** in the previous layer

# 38 of 45

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]

-1

-5

2

0

0

2

-3

0

6

0

5

-7

4

0

0

3

Springenberg, Dosovitskiy, et al., Striving for Simplicity: The all convolutional net, 2015

# Saliency map by Guided backpropagation



 $h^{l+1}$  Cleaner saliency map

5

0

4

-1

1

3

 $\partial E$ 

 $\overline{\partial h^{l+1}}$ 

1

2

0

6

2

0

0

2

3

-3



Guided vs Deconvnet vs Vanilla Backpropagation

#### Guided Backpropagation tends to be "cleanest"

Backprop Deconv

Guided Backprop





[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]

Springenberg, Dosovitskiy, et al., Striving for Simplicity: The all convolutional net, 2015





Summary

#### Direct explanations highlight all regions in an image that lead to a decision

- Intervention-based:
  - perturbing pixels and see how the decision change
  - Computationally expensive
- Gradient-based:
  - approximates feature importance by backpropagation
  - computationally efficient

However, direct explanations assume no knowledge from the audience either about the network or the data









#### Shortcomings in Guided Backpropagation

#### However, Guided Backpropagation explanations are not class-discriminative

#### GB explanation for "airliner"

GB explanation for "bus"





41 of 45

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]

Nie, et al. "A theoretical explanation for perplexing behaviors of backpropagation-based visualizations." International Conference on Machine Learning. PMLR, 2018.





42 of 45

CELEBRATING 75 YEARS

#### Shortcomings in Guided Backpropagation

### Guided Backpropagation does not explain decisions; They reconstruct inputs



Conference on Machine Learning. PMLR, 2018.

#### **Direct Explanations** Shortcomings in Direct Explanations

Direct explanations highlight all pixels that lead to decision making; However, they provide no mechanism to choose targeted pixels based on class discriminability





Why Bullmastiff?



Why Tigercat?

#### We need Targeted Explanations!



43 of 45

[Visual Explainability] | [Ghassan AlRegib and Mohit Prabhushankar] | [Dec 5-7, 2023]

AlRegib, Ghassan, and Mohit Prabhushankar. "Explanatory paradigms in neural networks: Towards relevant and contextual explanations." *IEEE Signal Processing Magazine* 39.4 (2022): 59-72.





- There are **no "one size fits all" explanations** and techniques
- Indirect explanations requires knowledge of networks and data
  - They are only accessible to a few
- Direct explanations place no constraints on knowledge of the audience
  - Saliency via occlusion is a direct but computationally expensive explanation
  - Backpropagation assigns importance scores to pixels
  - Rectification can be performed on gradients to obtain deconvolution and guided backpropagation
- Guided backpropagation provides the cleanest explanations
  - However, it only reconstructs salient regions of the image without providing class-specific information





## References

#### Lecture 3: Visual Explanations I

- AlRegib, Ghassan, and Mohit Prabhushankar. "Explanatory paradigms in neural networks: Towards relevant and contextual explanations." *IEEE Signal Processing Magazine* 39.4 (2022): 59-72.
- Krizhevsky et al. "Imagenet classification with deep convolutional neural networks." Advances in neural information processing systems 25 (2012)
- Yosinski et al, "Understanding Neural Networks Through Deep Visualization", ICML DL Workshop 2014.
- Springenberg et al, "Striving for Simplicity: The All Convolutional Net", ICLR Workshop 2015
- Matthew D Zeiler and Rob Fergus, "Visualizing and understanding convolutional networks," in European conference on computer vision. Springer, 2014, pp. 818– 833
- Van der Maaten and Hinton, "Visualizing Data using t-SNE", JMLR 2008
- Zeiler and Fergus, "Visualizing and Understanding Convolutional Networks", ECCV 2014
- Simonyan, Vedaldi, and Zisserman, "Deep Inside Convolutional Networks: Visualising Image Classification Models and Saliency Maps", ICLR Workshop 2014.
- Ribeiro et al, ""Why Should I Trust You?" Explaining the Predictions of Any Classifier", ACM KDD 2016
- Springenberg, Dosovitskiy, et al., Striving for Simplicity: The all convolutional net, 2015
- Nie, et al. "A theoretical explanation for perplexing behaviors of backpropagation-based visualizations." International Conference on Machine Learning. PMLR, 2018.





